arXiv:1202.2986v1 [math.CO] 14 Feb 2012

SUBTRACTION GAMES WITH THREE ELEMENT SUBTRACTION SETS

NHAN BAO HO

Abstract. We study the periodicity of nim-sequences of subtraction games having subtraction sets with three elements. In particular, we give solutions in several cases, and we describe how these subtraction sets can be augmented by additional numbers without changing the nim-sequence. The paper concludes with two conjectures.

1. Introduction

A *subtraction game* is a two-player game involved a pile of coins and a finite set S of positive integers called the *subtraction set*. The two players move alternately, subtracting some s coins such that $s \in S$. The player who makes the last move wins. Subtraction games provide classical examples of impartial combinatorial games; see [1, 3, 4]. They are completely understood for two element subtraction sets. For larger subtraction sets, they are known to be all ultimately periodic [3, p.83], but a complete solution of these games is still not known, even for three element subtraction sets. The purpose of this paper is to report further results in this area.

Before presenting our results, we need to recall some notation and terminology. Throughout this paper, subtraction sets $S = \{s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k\}$ will be ordered $s_1 < s_2 < \cdots < s_k$. The subtraction game with the subtraction set S is denoted by $\mathcal{S}(S)$ or $\mathcal{S}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$. It is well known that it suffices to consider subtraction sets whose members are relatively prime [4, p. 529]. If G is a subtraction game, then for each non-negative integer n, we denote $\mathcal{G}_G(n)$ (or just $\mathcal{G}(n)$ if there is no confusion) the *Sprague-Grundy value*, or *nim-value* for short, of the single pile of size n of the game G. The sequence $\{\mathcal{G}(n)\}$ is called the *nim-sequence* of the subtraction game G. Recall that $\{\mathcal{G}(n)\}$ is said to be *ultimately periodic* if there exist integers $p \geq 1$ and $n_0 \geq 1$ such that $\mathcal{G}(n + p) = \mathcal{G}(n)$ for all $n \geq n_0$. The smallest such numbers p

---

Date: (date1), and in revised form (date2).

2000 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary: 91A46; Secondary: 11B99.

Key words and phrases. Subtraction game, subtraction set, periodicity.

and n_0 are called the *period* and *pre-period* respectively. If $n_0 = 0$ then the sequence is said to be *periodic*. Aspects of subtraction games are studied in [1, 3, 4]. The following lemma gives a short algorithm for checking if the nim-sequence of a subtraction game is periodic.

Lemma 1. [1, p. 148] *If* $G = \mathcal{S}(s_1, ..., s_k)$ *be a subtraction game and* $\mathcal{G}(n+p) = \mathcal{G}(n)$ *for* $n_0 \leq n < n_0 + s_k$*, then* G *is periodic with period* p *and pre-period* n_0*.*

For a given subtraction set S, if there exists a positive integer s such that $\mathcal{G}(n+s) \neq \mathcal{G}(n)$ for all nonnegative integers n, then s can be added into the subtraction set S without changing the nim-sequence of $\mathcal{S}(S)$ [3, p. 84]. Let S^{ex} be the set consisting of all such s. If $\mathcal{S}(S)$ is periodic with period p, then the set $S^{*p} = \{s + mp | s \in S, m \geq 0\}$ is a subset of S^{ex}. For ultimately periodic subtraction games, the inclusion $S^{*p} \subseteq S^{ex}$ does not necessarily hold. In fact, for many subtraction games, we have $S^{ex} = S$. For this reason, if $S^{ex} = S^{*p}$ or $S^{ex} = S$, the subtraction set S is said to be *non-expandable*. Otherwise, S^{ex} is called the *expansion* of the subtraction set S. Some values of the expansions of certain subtraction sets with numbers up to 7 can be found in [3, pp. 84-85].

If the nim-sequence of a subtraction game G is purely periodic with period 2, then it has alternating nim-values $0, 1, 0, 1, 0, 1, \ldots$, and is said to be *bipartite*. If G is periodic with period 2, and so ultimately has alternating nim-values $0, 1, 0, 1, 0, 1, \ldots$, then G is said to be *ultimately bipartite*. The following result from [5] shows that for bipartite subtraction games, S^{ex} is the set of odd positive integers.

Theorem 1. *Let* S *be a subtraction set with* $\gcd(S) = 1$*. The subtraction game* $\mathcal{S}(S)$ *is bipartite if and only if* $1 \in S$ *and the elements of* S *are all odd.*

This paper is organised as follows. In Section 2, we give the expansion of 2-element subtraction sets. In Section 3, we consider the periodicity of some subtraction games of the form $\mathcal{S}(1, a, b)$ and the expansions of these subtraction sets. We then consider subtraction games $\mathcal{S}(a, b, a+b)$ in Section 4. Some subtraction games of different forms are presented in Sections 5 and 6. In Section 7, we present a family of ultimately bipartite subtraction games and we examine the expansions of subtraction sets of ultimately bipartite subtraction games. In the final section, we present two conjectures that have become apparent during this work.

Throughout this paper, when saying that a subtraction game has periodic p and nim-sequence $g_1 g_2 \ldots g_p$, we mean that ultimately, the nim-sequence is the infinite repetition of the subsequence $g_1, g_2, \ldots, g_p$. The omission of commas between the nim-values does not lead to any misunderstanding as all nim-values presented in this paper have exactly one digit. We do not give the proofs for all results. There are considerable similarities in the proofs of the various results. We give one proof for the expansion of the subtraction set (Theorem 2) and one proof for the nim-sequence (Theorem 3). The details of proofs for other stated results are similar; some are quite tedious but they are all straight forward.

2. SUBTRACTION GAMES $\mathcal{S}(a,b)$

This section studies the expansion of subtraction set $\{a,b\}$ where a,b are relatively prime with $a<b$. We assume furthermore that if $a=1$, then b is not odd, since that case is treated by Theorem 1. Berlekamp *et al.* [4, p. 530] showed that in this case, if $b=sa+r$ for some s,r with $s\ge 1, 0\le r<a$ then the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a,b)$ is periodic with period $a+b$ and nim-sequence

$$\begin{cases}(0^a1^a)^{\frac{s}{2}}0^r2^{a-r}1^r, & \text{if } s \text{ is even;}\\ (0^a1^a)^{\frac{s+1}{2}}2^r, & \text{if } s \text{ is odd.}\end{cases}$$

Moreover, they also observed that the expansion S^{ex} is periodic in the sense that if $n\in S^{ex}$, then $n+a+b\in S^{ex}$. We include this observation in a more general result as follows:

Theorem 2. *Let a,b be relatively prime, positive integers such that $a<b$. Suppose furthermore that if $a=1$, then b is even. Consider the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a,b)$. If $a+1<b\le 2a$, then the subtraction set has expansion*

$$\{a, a+1, \ldots, b\}^{*(a+b)}.$$

If either $a=1$, or $b=a+1$, or $b>2a$, then the subtraction set is non-expandable.

Proof. Note that for non-negative integers k,j such that $ka+j\le b$ we have

$$\mathcal{G}(ka+j)=\begin{cases}0, & \text{if } k \text{ is even;}\\ 1, & \text{otherwise.}\end{cases}$$

We first prove the case where $a=1$. It is sufficient to show that for all $c\in\{0,1,\ldots,b\}\backslash\{1,b\}$, there exists n such that $\mathcal{G}(n+c)=\mathcal{G}(n)$. Note that b is even and the nim-sequence is

$$(01)^{\frac{b}{2}}2.$$

If c is even, let $n = 0$. We have $\mathcal{G}(n + c) = 0 = \mathcal{G}(n)$. If c is odd, let $n = b - 1$. As $1 \leq c - 2 \leq b - 3$, we have

$$\mathcal{G}(n + c) = \mathcal{G}(b - 1 + c) = \mathcal{G}(b + 1 + c - 2) = \mathcal{G}(c - 2) = 1 = \mathcal{G}(n).$$

For $a > 1$, our first goal is to show that if either $0 \leq c \leq a - 1$ or $b + 1 \leq c \leq a + b - 1$, there exists n such that $\mathcal{G}(n + c) = \mathcal{G}(n)$. In fact, let $n = a$. In the former case, we have $a + c \leq 2a - 1$ and so

$$\mathcal{G}(n + c) = \mathcal{G}(a + c) = 1 = \mathcal{G}(n).$$

In the latter case, we have $a + c = a + b + c - b$ and $1 \leq c - b \leq a - 1$, so

$$\mathcal{G}(n + c) = \mathcal{G}(a + c) = \mathcal{G}(c - b) = 0 = \mathcal{G}(n).$$

We now consider integers between a and b. First suppose that $b \leq 2a$ and let $a \leq c \leq b$. We claim that $\mathcal{G}(n + c) \neq \mathcal{G}(n)$ for all n. Recall that the nim-sequence of $\mathcal{S}(a, b)$ is:

$$\begin{cases} 0^a 1^a 2^a, & \text{if } b = 2a; \\ 0^a 1^a 2^r, & \text{if } b = a + r. \end{cases}$$

It can be checked that if $\mathcal{G}(n)$ is in a block $0's$ then $\mathcal{G}(n+c)$ is either in a block $1's$ or in a block $2's$; if $\mathcal{G}(n)$ is in a block $1's$ then $\mathcal{G}(n+c)$ is either in a block $2's$ or in a block $0's$; if $\mathcal{G}(n)$ is in a block $2's$ then $\mathcal{G}(n+c)$ is either in a block $0's$ or in a block $1's$. Therefore, $\mathcal{G}(n+c) \neq \mathcal{G}(n)$. When $b > 2a$, it remains to show that if $a < c < b$, there exists positive integer n such that $\mathcal{G}(n+c) = \mathcal{G}(n)$. Assume that $c = ka + i$ for some integers k, i with $k \geq 1, 0 \leq i < a, a < ka + i < b$. Consider the case where k is even. If $k < s$, let $n = 0$. Then $\mathcal{G}(n + c) = \mathcal{G}(ka + i) = 0 = \mathcal{G}(n)$. If $k = s$ then $i < r$. Let $n = sa - a$. Since $sa + a + r = a + b$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{G}(n + ka + i) &= \mathcal{G}(sa + a + r + (k - 2)a + i - r) \\ &= \mathcal{G}((k - 3)a + a + i - r) = \mathcal{G}((k - 3)a) = 1 = \mathcal{G}(n). \end{aligned}$$

Consider the case where k is odd. If $k = 1$, then $i > 0$. Let $n = a - 1$. We have

$$\mathcal{G}(n + c) = \mathcal{G}\big(a - 1 + i(a + b) + a + i\big) = \mathcal{G}(2a + i - 1) = 0 = \mathcal{G}(n).$$

If $k > 1$, we consider the parity of s. Assume that s is even. If $i \leq r$, let

$$n = b - a - i = (s - 1)a + r - i.$$

We have $\mathcal{G}(n) = 1$ and

$$\mathcal{G}(n+c) = \mathcal{G}(b-a-i+ka+i) = \mathcal{G}(b+a+(k-2)a) = \mathcal{G}((k-2)a) = 1.$$

If $i > r = 0$, let $n = b - a$. We have $\mathcal{G}(n) = 1$ and

$$\mathcal{G}(n+c) = \mathcal{G}(b-a+ka+i) = \mathcal{G}(a+b+(k-2)a+i) = \mathcal{G}((k-2)a+i) = 1.$$

If $i > r > 0$, let $n = a - i + r - 1$, we have

$$\mathcal{G}(n+c) = \mathcal{G}(a-i+r-1+ka+i) = \mathcal{G}\big((k+1)a+r-1\big) = 0 = \mathcal{G}(n).$$

Assume that s is odd. If $i < r$, let $n = sa$. We have $\mathcal{G}(n) = 1$ and

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{G}(n+c) &= \mathcal{G}(sa+ka+i) = \mathcal{G}\big(sa+a+r+(k-2)a+a+i-r\big)\\ &= \mathcal{G}\big((k-2)a+a+i-r\big) = 1.\end{aligned}$$

If $i > r$, let $n = sa + a - 1$. We have $\mathcal{G}(n) = 1$ and

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{G}(n+c) &= \mathcal{G}(sa+a-1+ka+i) = \mathcal{G}(sa+a+r+ka+i-r-1)\\ &= \mathcal{G}(ka+i-r-1) = 1.\end{aligned}$$

If $i = r$, then $i \neq 0$ and $k < s$. Let $n = a - 1$, we have $\mathcal{G}(n) = 0$ and

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{G}(n+c) &= \mathcal{G}(a-1+ka+i) = \mathcal{G}\big((k+1)a+i-1\big)\\ &= \mathcal{G}\big((k+1)a\big) = 0.\end{aligned}$$

□

3. Subtraction games $\mathcal{S}(1, a, b)$

In this section, we examine the periodicity and the expansions of some subtraction games of the form $\mathcal{S}(1, a, b)$ in which $a < b$ and a, b are not both odd. Assume that $b = ka + r$ for some $k \geq 1, r < a$. We will present in this section the subtractions of the form $(1, a, ka + r)$ where $k \leq 3$. We will classify the games $\mathcal{S}(1, a, ka+r)$ into four families by the parity of a, r. We begin with the case where a is odd and b is even.

Theorem 3. *Let a be an odd positive integer and let b be an even positive integer with $a < b$. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, b)$ is periodic with the period $a + b$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{b}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-1}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{\{1, 3, \ldots, a\} \cup \{b, b+2, \ldots, b+a-1\}\}^{*(a+b)}.$$

Proof. We will only give the proof for the nim-sequence. We will show that the nim-sequence satisfies the condition $\mathcal{G}(n + a + b) = \mathcal{G}(n)$ for $0 \leq n \leq a + b - 1$ and the first $a + b$ nim-values are

$$(01)^{\frac{b}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-1}{2}}2.$$

Consider $\mathcal{G}(n)$ where $0 \leq n \leq b-1$. It can be checked by induction that

$$\mathcal{G}(n) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } n \text{ is even;} \\ 1 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases} \tag{1}$$

Consider $\mathcal{G}(n)$ where $b \leq n \leq a+b-1$. We have $\mathcal{G}(n) = mex\{\mathcal{G}(n-b), \mathcal{G}(n-a), \mathcal{G}(n-1)\}$. One can check by induction that

$$\mathcal{G}(n) = \begin{cases} 2 & \text{if } n \text{ is even;} \\ 3 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases} \tag{2}$$

Consider $\mathcal{G}(n)$ where $a+b \leq n \leq a+2b-1$. We have $\mathcal{G}(n) = mex\{\mathcal{G}(n-b), \mathcal{G}(n-a), \mathcal{G}(n-1)\}$. We can check by induction that

$$\mathcal{G}(n) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ 1 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases} \tag{3}$$

Consider $\mathcal{G}(n)$ where $a+2b \leq n \leq 2(a+b)-1$. We have $\mathcal{G}(n) = mex\{\mathcal{G}(n-b), \mathcal{G}(n-a), \mathcal{G}(n-1)\}$. We can check by induction that

$$\mathcal{G}(n) = \begin{cases} 2 & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ 3 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases} \tag{4}$$

By combining (1) to (4), we have the first $2(a+b)$ nim-values as follows

$$(01)^{\frac{b}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-1}{2}}2$$
$$(01)^{\frac{b}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-1}{2}}2.$$

Note that the condition $\mathcal{G}(n+a+b) = \mathcal{G}(n)$ holds for $0 \leq n \leq a+b-1$. By Lemma 1, the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,b)$ is periodic with the period $a+b$ and nim-sequence

$$(01)^{\frac{b}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-1}{2}}2.$$

□

Remark 1. The nim sequence for the special case $b = a+1$ of Theorem 3 was given in Berlekamp *et al.* [3].

Note that if a is odd, the game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,b)$ has been solved in Theorem 1 (if b is odd) and Theorem 3 (if b is even). Therefore, in the rest of this section, we will only consider the game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,b)$ where a is even. We divide the rest of this section into three parts corresponding to three cases of the game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,ka+r)$ where $k \leq 3$: $k=1$, $k=2$, and $k=3$.

3.1. **Subtraction games $\mathcal{S}(1,a,a+r)$.** There are two possibilities for r: (i) r is even, and (ii) r is odd. For (i), we have

Theorem 4. *Let a, r be even positive integers with $a > r$. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,a+r)$ is periodic with period $2a+r$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}(23)^{\frac{r}{2}-1}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1,a,a+2,\ldots,a+r,2a+r-1\}^{*(2a+r)}.$$

For (ii), we first present the game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,a+r)$ with $r=1$. It was shown in [3] that the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,a+1)$, where a is even, is periodic with period $2a$ and nim-sequence

$$(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a}{2}}.$$

We now present the expansion of the subtraction set $(1,a,a+1)$.

Theorem 5. *Let $a \geq 2$ be an even integer. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,a+1)$ has expansion*

$$\{\{1,3,\ldots,a-1\}\cup\{a\}\cup\{a+1,a+1+2,\ldots,2a-1\}\}^{*(2a)}.$$

When $r \geq 3$, we consider two cases for a: $a=r+1$ and $a \geq r+3$.

Theorem 6. *Let $r \geq 3$ be an odd integer and let $a = r+1$. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,a+r)$, which becomes $\mathcal{S}(1,a,2a-1)$, is periodic with period $2a$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2(01)^{\frac{a-2}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set is non-expandable.

Theorem 7. *Let $r \geq 3$ be an odd integer and $a \geq r+3$ be an even integer. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1,a,a+r)$ is ultimately periodic with period $2a+r$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{r+1}{2}}2(01)^{\frac{a-2}{2}}2(01)^{\frac{r+1}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-r-3}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1,a,a+r\}\cup\{a+r+2,2a+r+1,3a+r\}^{*(2a+r)}.$$

3.2. **Subtraction games $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 2a+r)$.** We consider two cases for r: (i) r is even, and (ii) r is odd. For (i), we first deal with the case where $r = 0$.

Theorem 8. *Let $a \geq 2$ be an even integer. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 2a)$ is periodic with period $3a$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-2}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{\{1\} \cup \{a, a+2, \ldots, 2a\} \cup \{3a-1\}\}^{*3a}.$$

When $r \geq 2$, we separate two different cases comparing r and a: $a = r+2$ and $a \geq r+4$. We now solve the case where $a = r+2$. Note that when $a = r+2$, the game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 2a+r)$ becomes $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a-2)$.

Theorem 9. *Let $a \geq 4$ be an even integer. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a-2)$ is ultimately periodic with period $3a-1$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2(01)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2.$$

Moreover, if $a = 4$ then the subtraction set is non-expandable; otherwise, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1, a, 3a-2, 3a\} \cup \{4a-1, 6a-1\}^{*(3a-1)}.$$

When $a \geq r+4$, we have

Theorem 10. *Let r, a be even integers with $r \geq 2, a \geq r+4$. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 2a+r)$ is ultimately periodic with period $3a+r$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{r}{2}+1}2((01)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2)^2(01)^{\frac{r}{2}+1}(23)^{\frac{a-r}{2}-2}2.$$

Moreover, if $r = 2$ then the subtraction set is non-expandable; otherwise, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1, a, 2a+r, 2a+r+2, 3a+r+1, 5a+2r+2\}.$$

For (ii), we will first present the games with $r = 1$. Note that the following result can be deduced from Theorem 2, because $2a+1$ belongs to the expansion of the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a)$.

Theorem 11. *Let $a \geq 2$ be an even integer. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 2a+1)$ is periodic with period $a+1$ and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set is non-expandable.

When $r \geq 3$, we have

Theorem 12. *Let $r \geq 3$ be an odd integer and $a \geq r+1$ be an even integer. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 2a+r)$ is periodic with period $3a+r$ and nim-sequence*

$$((01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2)^2(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}(23)^{\frac{r-3}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1, a, a+2, 2a+r-2, 2a+r, 3a+r-1\}^{*(3a+r)}.$$

3.3. **Subtraction games $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a+r)$.** We will consider two cases for r: (i) r is even; and (ii) r is odd. For (i), there are two different rules for r depending on whether $r = 0$ or $r > 0$. For the former case, we have

Theorem 13. *Let $a \geq 4$ be an even integer. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a)$ is periodic with period $3a+1$ and nim-sequence*

$$((01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2)^2(01)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1, a, 2a+1, 3a\}^{*(3a+1)}.$$

If $r > 0$, we first consider the cases $r = 2, 4$. By Theorem 2, we have

Corollary 1. *Let a, r be even integers with $r = 2, 4$ and $a > r$. The nim-sequence of the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a+r)$ is exactly that of the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a)$.*

Proof. We first consider the game $\mathcal{S}(1, a)$. We have shown in the section 2 that the game $\mathcal{S}(1, a)$ is periodic with period $1+a$. Moreover, an integer b can be added into the subtraction set without changing the nim-sequence if and only if $b \in \{1, a\}^{*(1+a)}$. Now consider the integer $3a+r$. Note that

$$3a+r = \begin{cases} a+2(1+a), & \text{if } r = 2; \\ 1+3(1+a), & \text{if } r = 4 \end{cases}$$

and so $3a+r \in \{1, a\}^{*(1+a)}$ for $r = 2, 4$. This completes the proof. $\square$

For $r \geq 6$, we have

Theorem 14. *Let a, r be even integers such that $a > r \geq 6$. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a+r)$ is periodic with period $4a+r$ and nim-sequence*

$$((01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2)^4(23)^{\frac{r}{2}-2}.$$

Moreover, if $r = 6$*, the subtraction set has expansion*

$$\{1, 2, a+2, 2a+3, 3a+r-2, 3a+r, 4a+r-1\}^{*(4a+r)};$$

otherwise, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1, 2, a+2, 3a+r-2, 3a+r, 4a+r-1\}^{*(4a+r)}.$$

For (ii), we first present the case where $r = 1$:

Theorem 15. *Let* $a \geq 2$ *be an even integer. The subtraction game* $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a+1)$ *is periodic with period* $4a+1$ *and nim-sequence*

$$((01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2)^3(23)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{1, a, a+2, 3a-1, 3a+1, 4a\}^{*(4a+1)}.$$

When $r \geq 3$, we have three cases: $a = r+1$, $a = r+3$ and $a \geq r+5$.

Theorem 16. *Let* $r \geq 3$ *be an odd integer and* $a = r+1$*. The subtraction game* $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a+r)$ *is ultimately periodic with period* $4a$ *and nim-sequence*

$$((01)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2)^2((01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2)^2.$$

Moreover, if $r = 3$ *then the subtraction set is non-expandable; otherwise, the subtraction set has expansion*

$$\{1, a, 4a-1\} \cup \{4a+1, 5a\}^{*(4a)} = \{1, a, 3a+r\} \cup \{3a+r+2, 4a+r+1\}^{*(4a)}.$$

Theorem 17. *Let* $r \geq 3$ *be an odd integer and* $a = r+3$*. The subtraction game* $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a+r)$ *is ultimately periodic with period* $4a-2$ *and nim-sequence*

$$((01)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2)^3(01)^{\frac{a}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, if $r = 3$ *then the subtraction set is non-expandable; otherwise, the subtraction set has expansion*

$$\{1, a, 4a-3, 4a-1, 5a-2, 9a-4\} = \{1, a, 3a+r, 3a+r+2, 4a+r+1, 7a+2r+2\}.$$

Theorem 18. *Let* $r \geq 3$ *be an odd integer and* $a \geq r+5$ *be an even integer. The subtraction game* $\mathcal{S}(1, a, 3a+r)$ *is ultimately periodic with period* $4a+1$ *and nim-sequence*

$$(01)^{\frac{r+3}{2}}2((01)^{\frac{a}{2}-1}2)^3(01)^{\frac{r+3}{2}}(23)^{\frac{a-r-5}{2}}2.$$

Moreover, if $r = 3$*, the subtraction set is non-expandable; otherwise, the subtraction set has expansion*

$$\{1, a, 3a+r, 3a+r+2, 4a+r+1, 7a+2r+2\}.$$

4. SUBTRACTION GAMES $\mathcal{S}(a, b, a+b)$

In this section, we discuss the extension of the subtraction set of the game $\mathcal{S}(a, b, a+b)$ with $2 \leq a < b$. Note that b can be represented as $ka + r$ for some integers k, r with $0 \leq r \leq a-1$. Recall from [4, p.531] that when k is odd, the game $\mathcal{S}(a, b, a+b)$ is periodic with period $(ka + a + b)$ and nim-sequence

$$(0^a 1^a)^{\frac{k+1}{2}} (2^a 3^a)^{\frac{k-1}{2}} 2^a 3^r.$$

Moreover, we have

Theorem 19. *Let a, b be positive integers such that $2 \leq a < b$. Consider the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, b, a+b)$. Assume that $b = ka + r$ where k is odd and $0 < r < a$. The subtraction set has expansion*

$$\begin{aligned}&\big\{\{sa : s \textit{ is odd}, s \leq k\}\\ &\cup\{ka+1, ka+2, \ldots, b+a\}\\ &\cup\{b + sa : s \textit{ is odd}, s \leq k\}\big\}^{*(b+(k+1)a)}\end{aligned}$$

When k is even, it is claimed in [4, p. 531] that the game is periodic with period $(2b + r)a$. We have not seen a proof of this claim, and at present we do not know the nim-sequence or expansion set for this case.

5. SUBTRACTION GAMES $\mathcal{S}(a, ka+r, (k+2j)a+r)$

In this section and the next we give further results without proof for some 3-element subtraction sets. As we show, there are special cases where, with sufficient effort, one can observe the pattern of periodicity. Nevertheless, there are many cases where behaviors are more difficult to discern.

We will deal with two general cases with $j = 1, 2$ and one special case with $j = 3, r = 1$.

Theorem 20. *Let a, k, r be positive integers with $a \geq 2, r < a$. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, ka+r, (k+2)a+r)$ is periodic with period $ka+a+r$ and nim-sequence*

$$\begin{cases}(0^a 1^a)^{\frac{k}{2}} 0^r 2^{a-r} 1^r, & \textit{if } k \textit{ is even;}\\ (0^a 1^a)^{\frac{k+1}{2}} 2^r, & \textit{otherwise.}\end{cases}$$

Moreover, the subtraction set is non-expandable.

Theorem 21. *Let a, k, r be positive integers with $r < a, k \geq 3$. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, ka+r, (k+4)a+r)$ is periodic with period $2ka+4a+2r$ and nim-sequence*

$$\begin{cases} ((0^a1^a)^{\frac{k}{2}}0^r2^{a-r}1^r)^2 3^{a-r}0^r2^{a-r}1^r, & \text{if } k \text{ is even;} \\ ((0^a1^a)^{\frac{k+1}{2}}2^r)^2 0^{a-r}3^r1^{a-r}2^r, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

Moreover, in both cases, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{a, ka+r, (k+2)a+r, (k+4)a+r, (2k+3)a+2r\}^{*(2ka+4a+2r)}$$

Theorem 22. *Let a, k be integers such that $a \geq 2, k \geq 3$ and k is odd. The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, ka+1, (k+6)a+1)$ is periodic with period $2ka+6a+2$ and nim-sequence*

$$((0^a1^a)^{\frac{k+1}{2}}2)^2(0^{a-1}31^{a-1}2)^2.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set has expansion

$$\{a, ka+1, (k+2)a+1, (k+4)a+1, (k+6)a+1), (2k+5)a+2\}^{*(2ka+6a+2)}.$$

6. Subtraction games $\mathcal{S}(a, 2a+r, 3a+r+1)$ where $r+1 \leq a$

We first consider the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, 2a, 3a+1)$, where $a \geq 2$. Althöfer and Bültermann [2] showed that the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, 2a, 3a+1)$, where $a \geq 2$, has pre-period $4a-1$ and period

$$p = \begin{cases} 3, & \text{if } a = 2; \\ 4a+1, & \text{if } a > 2. \end{cases}$$

For $a > 2$, it can be checked that the nim-sequence is

$$10^{a-1}21^{a-1}02^{a-1}103^{a-2}2.$$

Theorem 23. *Let $a \geq 2$ be positive integers. Consider the subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, 2a, 3a+1)$. The subtraction set has expansion*

$$\{a\} \cup \{2a, 3a+1, 5a\}^{*(4a+1)}.$$

Theorem 24. *The subtraction game $\mathcal{S}(a, 2a+1, 3a+2)$, where $a \geq 2$, is periodic with period $4a+2$ and nim-sequence*

$$0^a1^a02^{a-1}103^{a-2}21.$$

Moreover, the subtraction set is non-expandable.

Theorem 25. *The subtraction game* $\mathcal{S}(a, 2a+2, 3a+3)$ *with* $a \geq 4$ *is ultimately periodic with period* $4a+3$ *and nim-sequence*

$$2^{a-2}11003^{a-4}22110^{a-1}21^{a-1}00.$$

When $a = 4$*, the subtraction set is non-expandable. Otherwise, the subtraction set has expansion*

$$\{a, 2a+2, 3a+3\} \cup \{3a+4\}^{*(4a+3)}.$$

7. More on ultimately bipartite subtraction games

Some ultimately bipartite subtraction games were exhibited in [5]. In particular the games with subtraction sets $\{3, 5, 2^k+1\}$, for $k \geq 3$, and $\{a, a+2, 2a+3\}$, for odd $a \geq 3$, are all ultimately bipartite. In this section, we first present another family of ultimately bipartite subtraction games with 3-element subtraction sets. We then consider the expansions of subtraction sets of ultimately bipartite subtraction games.

Theorem 26. *For odd integer* $a \geq 5$*, the subtraction game* $\mathcal{S}(a, 2a+1, 3a)$ *is ultimately bipartite.*

Before giving the proof for Theorem 26, we need the following elementary fact:

Lemma 2. *Suppose that the position set of a game* G *is the disjoint union of two sets* A, B *such that*

1. *for every position* p *in* A*, all the moves from* p *terminate in* B*,*
2. *for every position* p *in* B*, there is a move from* p *that terminates in* A*.*

Then A *is the set of positions of nim-value zero, and* B *is the set of positions of nim-values non-zero.*

Proof of Theorem 26. Throughout the proof, the set $\{x, x+1, x+2, \ldots, y\}$ is denoted $\{x, \ldots, y\}$. Let $k = \frac{a-5}{2}$. Let A_0, $A_{0,0}$ be the sets of even integers in the sets $\{a+1, \ldots, 2a-2\}$, $\{2a+2, \ldots, 4a-2\}$ respectively. For every nonnegative integer $i \leq k$, let $A_{1,i}$, $A_{2,i}$, $A_{3,i}$ be the sets of even integers in the sets

- $\{5a+3+i(4a+2), \ldots, 6a-2+i4a\}$,
- $\{6a+4+i(4a+2), \ldots, 7a-1+i4a\}$,
- $\{7a+3+i(4a+2), \ldots, 8a-2+i4a\}$

respectively. For every nonnegative integer $i \leq k$, let B_i be the set of odd integers in the set

$$\{4a + 3 + i(4a + 2), \dots, 5a - 2 + i4a\}.$$

Set

$$\begin{aligned}
&A = A_0 \cup A_{0,0} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq l \leq 3 \\ 0 \leq i \leq k}} A_{l,i} \\
&B = \bigcup_{0 \leq i \leq k} B_i, \\
&C = \{i : i \in \mathbb{Z}, 0 \leq i \leq a - 1\}, \\
&D = C \cup B \cup (\{\text{even positive integers}\} \setminus A).
\end{aligned}$$

Let $s_1 = a, s_2 = 2a + 1, s_3 = 3a$, $I = \{1, 2, 3\}$. The theorem follows from Lemma 2, provided we prove that

(a) if $m \in D$, then $m - s_l \notin D$, for all $l \in I$,
(b) if $m \notin D$, then $m - s_l \in D$ for some $l \in I$.

In the following, if two sets X, Y satisfy the condition $max(X) < min(Y)$ then we write $X < Y$. For a given set X of integers and a given integer y, the set $\{x + y : x \in X\}$ is denoted $X + y$. We skip the proof for following elementary facts

(i)

$$\begin{cases} A_{1,i} < A_{2,i} < A_{3,i} & (0 \leq i \leq k), \\ A_0 < A_{0,0} < B_0 < A_{l,0} < B_1 < A_{l,1} < \cdots < B_k < A_{l,k} & (l = 1, 2, 3). \end{cases}$$

(ii) $B_i - a = A_{3,i-1} \setminus \{min(A_{3,i-1})\}$.
(iii) $B_i - (2a + 1) = A_{2,i-1} \setminus \{max(A_{2,i-1})\}$.
(iv) $B_i - 3a = A_{1,i-1} \setminus \{min(A_{1,i-1})\}$.
(v) $B_0 - a \subset A_{0,0}$,
(vi) $B_0 - (2a + 1) \subset A_{0,0}$,
(vii) $B_0 - 3a = A_0 \setminus \{min(A_0)\}$.
(viii) For $1 \leq l \leq 3$, $A_{l,k}$ is singleton. The element of $A_{l,k}$ is denoted by $a_{l,k}$. Thus, $A_{l,k} = \{a_{l,k}\}$

For (a), let $m \in D$ and $m \geq a$. If m is odd, then $m \in B_i$ for some i. If $i = 0$, then using properties (v) – (vii),

$$m - s_l \in B_0 - s_l \subset A_0 \cup A_{0,0}$$

for all $l \in I$ and so $m - s_l \notin D$. If $i > 0$, for all $l \in I$, properties (ii)–(iv) give

$$m - s_l \in B_i - s_l \subset A_{1,i-1} \cup A_{2,i-1} \cup A_{3,i-1}$$

and so $m - s_l \notin D$. If m is even, then $m - s_l$ is odd for all $l \in I$. Therefore, for all $l \in I$, $m - s_l \notin D$ if only if $m - s_l \notin B$. We prove (a) by contradiction. Assume by contradiction that $m - s_l \in D$ for some $l \in I$. We have then $m - s_l \in B$. There must be then some $i \leq k$ such that $m - s_l \in B_i$ and so $m \in B_i + s_l$. It can be checked that

$$B_i + s_l = A_{l,i} \quad \text{where } 0 \leq i \leq k, 1 \leq l \leq 3. \tag{5}$$

Note that $A_{l,i} \subset A$ and so $m \notin D$ giving a contradiction. Therefore, $m - s_l \notin D$ for all $l \in I$.

For (b), let $m \notin D$. If m is even, then $m \in A$ and $m > a$. Since $m \in A$, either $m \in A_0$ or $m \in A_{0,0}$ or $m \in A_{l,i}$ for some l, i where $1 \leq l \leq 3$, $0 \leq i \leq k$. If $m \in A_0$, then $a + 1 \leq m \leq 2a - 2$. Therefore, $1 \leq m - a \leq a - 2$ and so $m - a \in C \subset D$. If $m \in A_{0,0}$, then $2a + 2 \leq m \leq 4a - 2$. Let $a_{0,0} = \frac{max(A_{0,0})+min(A_{0,0})}{2} = 3a$. Since a is odd, $a_{0,0}$ is odd and so $m \neq a_{0,0}$. If $m < a_{0,0}$, then $2a+2 \leq m \leq 3a-1$ and so $1 \leq m - (2a+1) \leq a - 2$ which implies $m - (2a+1) \in C \subset D$. If $m > a_{0,0}$, then $3a+1 \leq m \leq 4a-2$ and so $1 \leq m-3a \leq a-2$ which implies $m - 3a \in C \subset D$. If $m \in A_{l,i}$ for some l, i, then $m - s_l \in B_i$ by (5) and so $m - s_l \in D$.

If m is odd, then $m \geq a$ and $m \notin B$. Assume that $m - a \notin D$ and $m - (2a+1) \notin D$, we show that $m - 3a \in D$. Assume by contradiction that $m-3a \notin D$. Since $m-3a$ is even, we must have $m-3a \in A$ which implies that either $m - 3a \in A_0$ or $m - 3a \in A_{0,0}$ or $m - 3a \in A_{l,i}$ for some l, i where $1 \leq l \leq 3$, $0 \leq i \leq k$. We claim that only the third case occurs. If $m - 3a \in A_0$, then $m - 3a = min(A_0)$. In fact, if otherwise, (vii) implies that $m \in B_0$ giving a contradiction. Since $min(A_0) = a+1$, we have $m - (2a+1) = 2a$. Note that $max(A_0) < 2a < min(A_{0,0})$. By (i), we have $m - (2a+1) \notin A$ which implies that $m - (2a+1) \in D$ giving a contradiction. If $m - 3a \in A_{0,0}$, note that $m - 3a$ is even and so $m - 3a \neq a_{0,0}$. If $m - 3a < a_{0,0}$, then $2a + 2 \leq m - 3a \leq 3a - 1$ and so

$$max(A_{0,0}) < 4a + 2 \leq m - a \leq 5a - 1 < min(A_{1,0}).$$

By (i), $m - a \notin A$ and so $m - a \in D$ giving a contradiction. If $m - 3a > a_{0,0}$, then $3a + 1 \leq m - 3a \leq 4a - 2$ and so

$$max(A_{0,0}) < 4a \leq m - (2a + 1) \leq 5a - 3 < min(A_{1,0}).$$

By (i), $m-(2a+1) \notin A$ and so $m-(2a+1) \in D$ giving a contradiction. We have shown that $m - 3a \notin A_0 \cup A_{0,0}$. Consequently, $m - 3a \in A_{l,i}$ for some l, i where $1 \leq l \leq 3, 0 \leq i \leq k$.

We show that $i < k$. Assume by contradiction that $i = k$. Note that the sets $A_{l,k}$, where $1 \leq l \leq 3$, are singletons by (viii). If $m-3a \in A_{1,k}$, then

$$m - 3a = a_{1,k} = 6a - 2 + k4a$$

implying $m = 3a + 6a - 2 + k4a$. Therefore,

$$a_{1,k} < m - (2a+1) = 7a - 3 + k4a < a_{2,k}$$

and so $m - (2a+1) \notin A$ (by (i)). This means $m - (2a+1) \in D$ giving a contradiction. If

$$m - 3a \in A_{2,k} \cup A_{3,k} = \{a_{2,k}, a_{3,k}\},$$

then $m - 3a \geq a_{2,k} = 7a - 1 + k4a$ or

$$m - a \geq 9a - 1 + k4a > 8n - 2 + k4a = a_{3,k} = max(A)$$

and so $m - a \notin A$. It follows that $m - a \in D$ giving a contradiction. Thus, $i < k$.

We now consider possible cases for l. If $l = 1$, then $i = 0$ and so $m - 3a \in A_{1,0}$. Since $m \notin B_1$, (iv) implies that

$$m - 3a = min(A_{1,0}) = 5a + 3$$

and so

$$m - (2a+1) = 6a + 2.$$

Note that

$$max(A_{1,0}) < 6a + 2 < min(A_{2,0}).$$

By (i), $m-(2a+1) \notin A$ and so $m-(2a+1) \in D$ giving a contradiction. If $l = 2$, then

$$6a + 4 + i(4a+2) \leq m - 3a \leq 7a - 1 + i4a$$

and so

$$8a + 4 + i(4a+2) \leq m - a \leq 9a - 1 + i4a = 5a - 1 + (i+1)4a$$

which implies that $max(A_{3,i}) < m-a < min(A_{1,i+1})$. By (i), $m-a \notin A$ and so $m - a \in D$ giving a contradiction. If $l = 3$, then

$$7a + 3 + i(4a+2) \leq m - 3a \leq 8a - 2 + i4a$$

and so

$$8a + 2 + i(4a+2) \leq m - (2a+1) \leq 9a - 3 + i4a = 5a - 3 + (i+1)4a$$

which implies that

$$max(A_{3,i}) < m - (2a+1) < min(A_{1,i+1}).$$

By (i), $m-(2a+1) \notin A$ and so $m-(2a+1) \in D$ giving a contradiction. □

We now give three partial results that place limitations on the expansions of subtraction sets of ultimately bipartite games. First we recall a well known result.

Lemma 3 (Ferguson's property)**.** [3, p. 86] *Let* S *be a subtraction set and* $s = min(S)$*. Then* $\mathcal{G}(n) = 0$ *if and only if* $\mathcal{G}(n+s) = 1$ *for all* n*.*

Lemma 4. *Let* $\mathcal{S}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ *be an ultimately bipartite subtraction game with pre-period* $n_0 > 0$*. Then* $n_0 \geq s_1 + s_k$*.*

Proof. Note that $s_1 > 1$ by Theorem 1. Consider the first $s_1 + s_k$ nim-values $\mathcal{G}(0), \mathcal{G}(1), \ldots, \mathcal{G}(s_1 + s_k - 1)$. Note that the first s_1 nim-values of the subsequence are all zero and so the last s_1 nim-values of the subsequence are non-zero as $\mathcal{G}(m + s_k) \neq \mathcal{G}(m)$ for all $m \leq s_1 - 1$. Therefore, the periodicity must start at some $n_0 \geq s_1 + s_k$. □

Lemma 5. *Let* $\mathcal{S}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ *be an ultimately bipartite subtraction game with pre-period* $n_0 > 0$*. Then* $\mathcal{G}(n_0) = 0$*,* $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1) \geq 2$*,* $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 2) = 0$*, and* $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_k) = 1$*.*

Proof. For the moment let $m = n_0$ if $\mathcal{G}(n_0) = 0$ and set $m = n_0 + 1$ if $\mathcal{G}(n_0) = 1$, so that $\mathcal{G}(m) = 0$. We have

$$\mathcal{G}(m+i) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } i \text{ is even;} \\ 1, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases} \tag{6}$$

Therefore, $\mathcal{G}(m-2+s_1) = 1$ and hence by Ferguson's property, $\mathcal{G}(m-2) = 0$. Notice that $\mathcal{G}(m-1) \neq 1$, as otherwise the periodicity would commence at $\mathcal{G}(m-2)$ or earlier. In particular, $\mathcal{G}(n_0) = 0$ and so $m = n_0$. Also by Ferguson's property, $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1) \neq 0$, as otherwise $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 + s_1) = 1$ contradicting (6). So $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1) \geq 2$. We now show that $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_k) = 1$. Note that

$$\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1) = mex\{\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_i) : 1 \leq i \leq k\}.$$

For each $i < k$, we have $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_i) \neq \mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_i + s_k)$. Moreover, by (6), we have $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_i + s_k) = 1$. Therefore, $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_i) \neq 1$ for all $i < k$. It follows that $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_k) = 1$. □

Lemma 6. *Let* $\mathcal{S}(s_1, s_2, \ldots, s_k)$ *be an ultimately bipartite subtraction game that is not bipartite. If* s *can be added into the subtraction set without changing the nim-sequence then* $s \leq s_k$*.*

Proof. Assume by contradiction that $s > s_k$. Note that all s_i are odd and greater than one. We also have $s > 1$ and s is odd. By Lemma 4, we have $n_0 \geq s_1 + s$. By Lemma 5, $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_k) = 1$ and so $\mathcal{G}(n_0 - 1 - s_k + s) \neq 1$. This contradicts (6) as $s - 1 - s_k$ is odd. □

8. Two conjectures

In this section, we present two conjectures that have come out of our investigations. The first conjecture concerns ultimately bipartite subtraction games and is motivated by our studies in the previous section.

Conjecture 1. *The subtraction set S of an ultimately bipartite subtraction game is non-expandable.*

The second conjecture concerns arbitrary subtraction games. Recall that the nim-value of the pile of size n for the game G is denoted by $\mathcal{G}(n)$. We define a function $\mathcal{V}$ on the positions of G as follows:

$$\mathcal{V}(n) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } \mathcal{G}(n) = 0; \\ 1, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

Since the sequence $\{\mathcal{G}(n)\}$ is periodic, so too is $\{\mathcal{V}(n)\}$. The periodicity of $\{\mathcal{V}(n)\}$ for some subtraction games can be found in [2].

Conjecture 2. *For every subtraction game, the sequences $\{\mathcal{G}(n)\}$ and $\{\mathcal{V}(n)\}$ have the same period p.*

It seems that finding the periodicity of the sequence $\{\mathcal{V}(n)\}$ for G is easier than finding that of the nim-sequence $\{\mathcal{G}(n)\}$. Therefore, Conjecture 2 may be useful in determining the periodicity of other subtraction games.

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to my supervisor, Dr. Grant Cairns, for several valuable suggestions regarding content and exposition.

References

[1] Michael H. Albert and Richard J. Nowakowski and David Wolfe, *Lessons in Play: An Introduction to Combinatorial Game Theory*, second ed., A K Peters Ltd., Wellesley, MA, 2007.

[2] Ingo Althöfer, Jörg Bültermann, *Superlinear period lengths in some subtraction games*, Theoretical Computer Science **148** (1995) 111-119.

[3] Elwyn R. Berlekamp, John H. Conway, and Richard K. Guy, *Winning ways for your mathematical plays. Vol. 1*, second ed., A K Peters Ltd., 2001.

[4] Elwyn R. Berlekamp, John H. Conway, and Richard K. Guy, *Winning ways for your mathematical plays. Vol. 3*, second ed., A K Peters Ltd., 2003.

[5] Grant Cairns and Nhan Bao Ho, *Ultimately bipartite subtraction games*, Australian Journal of Combinatorics **48** (2010) 213-220.

Department of Mathematics, La Trobe University, Melbourne, Australia 3086

E-mail address: `nbho@students.latrobe.edu.au, honhanbao@yahoo.com`